

.:ακΣ Consulting:.

TAXI MOBILE

**FINAL EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL AND
FINANCIAL REPORTS**

To

AFRINIC Ltd.

Patricia SENHOR – Cooperation & Project Development Manager

By

AKS Consulting

Kenneth SANVI, PMP – Consultant in International Development

Table of Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	3
I. CONTEXT AND DESCRIPTION	3
II. PURPOSE AND EXPECTED USE	3
III. OBJECTIVES	4
IV. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS.....	4
V. KEY RECOMMENDATIONS	4
THE EVALUATION	5
1. BACKGROUND INFORMATION	6
1.1. PURPOSE.....	6
1.2. AUDIENCE AND USE.....	6
1.3. OBJECTIVES	7
1.4. METHODOLOGY	7
1.5. TEAM.....	9
2. THE PROJECT	10
2.1. CONTEXT	10
2.2. UNDERLYNG RATIONALE.....	10
2.3. STAKEHOLDERS AND BENEFICIARIES	11
2.3.1. Stakeholders	11
2.4. CONCEPTUAL MODEL.....	12
2.4.1. Resources and activities	12
2.5. RESULT CHAIN AND LOGICAL FRAMEWORK.....	13
2.6. PROJECT MONITORING SYSTEM	13
2.7. EVALUATION FINDINGS	13
2.7.1. DESIGN.....	13
2.7.2. EFFECTIVENESS	14
2.7.3. EFFICIENCY OF PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION.....	14
2.8. RECOMMENDATIONS	16

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

I. CONTEXT AND DESCRIPTION

FIRE is a Grant and Awards program designed by AFRINIC in order to support and encourage the development of solutions to information and communication needs in the Africa Region. It places particular emphasis on the role of the Internet in the social and economic development for the benefit of the African community.

Launched in May 2012, the program is partly funded by two donors: IDRC and SIDA International Development Agencies. In 2013, AFRINIC selected eleven grant recipients which received 10 000 USD each for their project.

The grantees are bound by several obligations, which are among other things:

- Implementation and use of the project funds solely to perform the objectives and activities of their project
- Use the funds in accordance with the budget set out in their application
- Submission of an Interim and a Final Report in accordance with AFRINIC's report guidelines outlined in the Memorandum of Grant Conditions.

II. PURPOSE AND EXPECTED USE

AFRINIC required this evaluation in order to confirm that the project is run in accordance with the following criteria:

- Quality and reliance of design
- Effectiveness
- Efficiency of implementation
- Impact and potential of sustainability
- Replicability

AFRINIC also requires this evaluation to be run on the basis of the Interim and Financial Reports sent by the project in accordance with their obligations.

III. OBJECTIVES

AFRINIC requires this evaluation to ensure of the following:

- The project meets identified objectives;
- Enhance the Design and the implementation of FIRE programme;
- Demonstrate and Improve the impact of the various projects on the local community;
- Develop recommendations to improve the implementation and the monitoring of future projects;
- Ensure that funds allocated to the various projects are used efficiently and within the initial identified scope.

IV. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

Although the project seems on a good track, there is a lack of important information in the report misses significant. Thus, the report must show how the activities are implemented. Moreover, all the monitoring and archiving system of the project must be specified in the report. It is as important as the team of project pays a special attention to the expenses carried out and to specify if the project is given financings other than those of the program FIRE.

V. KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

The project seems to have put many efforts in the success of the activities. But the lack of experience appears in the way the management of the project has been conducted. The anxiety on this project should come from the cost overruns. There are some activities to go and at this stage it will be important that the FIRE program management gets in touch with the project team in order to ensure that the remaining activities would be conducted to their end and that the objectives of the project would be reached.

THE EVALUATION

1. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

1.1. PURPOSE

AFRINIC required this evaluation in order to confirm that the project is run in accordance with the following criteria:

- Quality and reliance of design
- Effectiveness
- Efficiency of implementation
- Impact and potential of sustainability
- Replicability

AFRINIC also requires this evaluation to be run on the basis of the Interim and Financial Reports sent by the project in accordance with their obligations.

AFRINIC requires this evaluation to ensure of the following:

- The project meets identified objectives;
- Enhance the Design and the implementation of FIRE programme;
- Demonstrate and Improve the impact of the various projects on the local community;
- Develop recommendations to improve the implementation and the monitoring of future projects;
- Ensure that funds allocated to the various projects are used efficiently and within the initial identified scope.

This evaluation is also required by AFRINIC in order to help the project in its implementation in accordance with the Memorandum of Grant Conditions.

1.2. AUDIENCE AND USE

The stakeholders who will make use of the evaluation reports are:

1. FIRE programme – AFRINIC
2. International Development Research Center (IDRC)
3. Swedish International Development Agency (SIDA)
4. The grantees

5. Prospective applicants to FIRE program

1.3. OBJECTIVES

AFRINIC requires this evaluation to ensure of the following:

- The project meets identified objectives;
- Enhance the Design and the implementation of FIRE programme;
- Demonstrate and Improve the impact of the various projects on the local community;
- Develop recommendations to improve the implementation and the monitoring of future projects;
- Ensure that funds allocated to the various projects are used efficiently and within the initial identified scope.

1.4. METHODOLOGY

The evaluation methodology is linked with the objectives, the evaluation questions and the type of evaluation.

Evaluation criteria	Key Results Areas	Evaluation questions	Data sources
Design	Assess the extent to which the project responds to priority issues and identified objectives.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Are the project objectives still valid? • Has the project team put in place the appropriate strategies? • Are there major risks that have not been taken into account? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Design documentation. • Project objectives. • Interim and final technical reports.
Effectiveness	Assess the project major key results.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Are the obtained results aligned with planned objectives? • Are the results in acceptable both in terms of the quantity and their 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Interim and final technical reports. • Project management plan. • Result monitoring

		quality?	report.
Efficiency	Assess the extent to which: - Project plan has been followed; - Project reports are up to date.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To which percentage has project plan been achieved to date? • Are expenses aligned with established budget? • Have data collected archived for future use? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project management plan. • Monitoring and control reports. • Financial reports. • Interim and final technical reports.
Impact	Assess to which extent the project will have a long-term positive impact on local community.	To which extent has the project's general objectives and final goals been achieved?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project objectives • Interim and final technical reports. • FIRE programme objectives
Sustainability	Assess to which extent the project has been socially and politically adopted by the local community.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Will the project contribute to long-term benefits? • Would the long-term benefits be materialized by the implementation of an organization? • What are the costs implications for scaling up impact? • Are there savings that could be made without compromising delivery? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project benefits report. • Project cost report. • Project monitoring report.

1.5. TEAM

M. Kenneth SANVI, PMP, is a Canadian Consultant in International Development, specialized in all areas of project management. M. SANVI is a seasoned expert with many audits and evaluations projects in several countries in Africa. He is also a trainer in many areas among which, monitoring and evaluation.

Ms. Rebecca GIDEON, CISA will perform the evaluation of Information Technology aspects of the reports. Ms. Gideon is an experienced Information Technology professional with over seven years of diversified experience.

2. THE PROJECT

2.1. *CONTEXT*

Yaounde and Douala respectively political and economic capital are the largest towns of Cameroon. In these towns, transportation is mainly done by taxis which usually have three modes of operation:

1. **Collective mode:** a taxi with available seats moves slowly close to people waiting to be driven. The future clients provide their destination to the driver and bargain about the price. A taxi has five places.
2. **"Deposit" mode:** a taxi is requested by a user or group of users who want to a specific location. The taxi is just available for the clients. The cost of ride is fixed.
3. **"Ride" mode:** a taxi is requested by a user or group of users for a specified period. The cost depends of duration of ride. As in the previous case, the driver cannot take any other passenger.

According to an online survey that has been conducted in September 2013 on a sample of 350 users of these two cities, it appears that users seeking taxis within the "deposit" mode or "ride" mode often face the following difficulties:

- The driver's identity is unknown in advance; which increases the risk of insecurity.
- The necessity to go to a crossroad or a station to find a taxi, even at late hours.
- The difficulty to immediately find a free taxi.

To solve these issues, Novazen designed "Cardispo" project, a mobile and web based platform to serve as a liaison between users and taxi drivers

2.2. *UNDERLYNG RATIONALE*

The project pursues two goals:

1. Develop a Mobile and web platform to connect users and taxi drivers in Yaoundé (Cameroon)
2. To Promote the developed platform to different stakeholders

During the implementation of the project, the objective n° 1 was modified. Indeed, the utilisation ratio of the smartphones being increased considerably in Cameroon, the team of project decided

to develop a portable application in complement of the SMS interface. The objective n°1 thus becomes the development of a SMS platform and a mobile application available to the users and taxi drivers in the towns of Yaounde and Douala.

2.3. STAKEHOLDERS AND BENEFICIARIES

2.3.1. Stakeholders

- a. FIRE programme – AFRINIC
- b. International Development Research Center (IDRC)
- c. Swedish International Development Agency (SIDA)
- d. The grantees
- e. Prospective applicants to FIRE program
- f. The taxi drivers
- g. Les users
- h. The project team
- i. Taxis unions
- j. Government of Cameroon
- k. ...

2.3.2. Users & Beneficiaries

The targets of the project are divided into two independent groups which are the users and the taxi drivers.

For each group of users, the advantages to use the service were listed below:

- For the users:
 - Security: The drivers are known in advance because they've already subscribed to the application Cardispo. The vehicles can be localised constantly and thus in case of danger an intervention can be immediate.
 - Comfort and quality of service: The taxis enrolled should be in good shape and have a good level of comfort. An ethic code will be applicable to the selected drivers. A phone line will be available for the customer service.
 - Effectiveness: A simple and effective way to get a taxi at home or everywhere else

- For the taxi drivers
 - Security: The users are identified in advance and vehicles can be localised in case of accident or aggression.
 - Profitability: A simple way to increase the number of customers at a tiny cost.

2.4. CONCEPTUAL MODEL

2.4.1. Resources and activities

The following activities were planned during the execution of the project:

- Brainstorming
- Development of the platform
- Negotiation and strategic signature of the agreements of partnership
- Installation of the legal aspect of the service
- Recruitment of the drivers
- Training of the drivers
- Marketing and communication around the service
- Official launch of the service

To carry out the activities identified above, in addition to the project team, the following resources were identified:

- 2 sales representatives
- 3 Developers
- 1 manager
- Funds provided by donors

Even the interim report recommended to provide the composition of the project team, this final report failed to mention it as well as the financial resources necessary for the realization of the project.

2.4.2. Expected results

The results expected at the end of the project are mentioned below:

- A platform Web of reservation and follow-up
- A mobile application of reservation and of follows
- A website of presentation of the product
- Agreements signed with strategic partners

2.5. **RESULT CHAIN AND LOGICAL FRAMEWORK**

The following milestones have been identified by the project team:

1. Development of the platform.
2. Installation of the database of the taxi drivers.
3. Training of the taxi drivers to the use of the platform
4. Starting of the service (Campaign marketing E of communication).

The final report failed to describe the way in which the various activities of the project proceeded.

2.6. **PROJECT MONITORING SYSTEM**

The final report does not provide any information on the way in which the activities of the project are monitored. This is a fundamental lack of each report.

2.7. **EVALUATION FINDINGS**

2.7.1. **DESIGN**

- Valid objectives

Even if that were not clearly shown in the report, it appears obvious that the objectives of the project remain valid since they were not reached yet. Even all the objectives are not completely met, they seem to be still valid as the problematic reported is still valid.

- Appropriate strategies

The description of the project should have given more information about the strategies used during the implementation of the project. It is thus important to clearly describe the strategy used so that we can really understand how the project team has implemented the activities.

- Major risks not accounted for

There is no mention in the report on the risks encountered by the project team. It is obvious that according to the nature of the project, several risks should be identified. This recommendation is still valid for this final report and nothing help us to get answer to our questions on the risks.

2.7.2. EFFECTIVENESS

- Results aligned with planed objectives

According to the results presented, the results seem to be aligned with the planed objectives even the objectives are not completely met by the time of the report. Another difficulty comes from the fact that quantitative objectives were not provided in a clear way in the report.

- Results acceptability

The acceptability of the results as well in term of quantity as of quality has not been clearly demonstrated in the report. Even if quantitative results are provided in the report, it is difficult to deduce if they are acceptable or not.

2.7.3. EFFICIENCY OF PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION

- Percentage of achieved project plan

A year after the project started, 90% of the activities planed have been performed.

At this stage, the main results are :

- A report on a market study conducted on 300 potential users and 100 taxi drivers
- A conception document
- 95% of realization of the platform

- A web application on the site : www.cardispo.com
- A mobile application named CarDispo is available on googlePlay
- 2 agreements signed with taxi drivers unions (SYNTRACAM, SYNARTUIRCAM)
- Agreements signed with financial partners
- A data base with more than 50 taxi drivers
- 25 taxi drivers trained on the usage of the platform
- Flyers conceived and realized
- A presentation video
- An audio spot
- A facebook page

➤ Expenses aligned with budget

At this stage of the project, 85 % of the funds were got from FIRE program which means a total deduction made of the banking expenses of 4 208 083 FCFA. We point out a cost overrun on all categories of expenses. The total of expenses rises at this moment at 8 285 000 FCFA an increase of more than 60 % of the amount expected from the FIRE program. It is to note that in accordance with the budget, 3 activities of the category of research and expenses were not realized yet. These expenses are evaluated at 650 000 FCFA; what would make the total of expenses jump at about 8 935 000 FCFA or about 80 % of overtaking of costs.

It would have been important that the report mentioned the reasons of the costs overruns, on the way the team plans to overcome the gap and how they plan to finance the remaining activities.

➤ Archive of collected data

The report does not provide enough information to assess that there is an archiving system of the data collected. It would be important that the final report provides all the information about how the archiving process has been conducted by the project team.

2.7.3. IMPACT

As the project is still on-going by the time of the report, the impact cannot be evaluated as well. Even the report mentioned some impacts, they are not the ones expected. The project should be ended and the app implemented to determine the real impacts. They should demonstrate how the outcome change the way of life of people after being used for a certain time.

2.8. RECOMMENDATIONS

The project seems to have put many efforts in the success of the activities. But the lack of experience appears in the way the management of the project has been conducted. The anxiety on this project should come from the cost overruns. There are some activities to go and at this stage it will be important that the FIRE program management gets in touch with the project team in order to ensure that the remaining activities would be conducted to their end and that the objectives of the project would be reached.